ICANN73 | Virtual Community Forum – GNSO: NCSG Membership Meeting
Thursday, March 10, 2022 – 09:00 to 10:00 AST

ANDREA GLANDON: Hello and welcome to the ICANN73 NCSG membership session. My name is Andrea Glandon and I am the remote participation manager for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and follows the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior.

During this session, questions or comments submitted in chat will only be read aloud if put in the proper form as I will note in the chat shortly. I will read questions and comments aloud during the time set by the chair or moderator of this session. If you would like to ask your question or make your comment verbally, please raise your hand. When called upon, kindly unmute your microphone and take the floor. Please state your name for the record and speak clearly at a reasonable pace. Mute your microphone when you are done speaking.

This session includes automated real-time transcription. Please note this transcript is not official or authoritative. To view the real-time transcription, click on the Closed Caption button in the Zoom toolbar.

To ensure transparency of participation in ICANN's multistakeholder model we ask that you sign into Zoom sessions using your full name— for example, a first name and last name or surname. You may be removed from the session if you do not sign in using your full name. With that I will hand the floor over to Bruna Martins Dos Santos. Please begin.

BRUNA SANTOS:	Thank you, Andrea, and welcome everyone. My name is Bruna. I'm the current chair of the NCSG and I am very happy to see so many of you here. Just for us to start this meeting, feel free to open your cameras if you want. If you don't, that's also okay. As Andrea was explaining whenever you have a question or want to raise your hand, just feel free to do so. And I'll give a look on the chat and also on the participants' list.

And for today we have a rather short agenda. But it's also a shorter meeting. We just have one hour. And we'll go through a little NomCom outreach. This was a request by the NomCom team. Shortly after that we're going to do some NCSG updates, not just constituencies but we're also welcoming both chairs of our constituencies, NPOC and NCUC, to bring us updates about their recent work. And I just wanted to bring back some discussions on DNS abuse as we're seeing this is a very present theme on this meeting's agenda. And maybe we can also use this space to hear some more views and ideas about this topic from our members.

So without longer ado I think I'm going to hand the floor to the NomCom reps just so we can start with their outreach and get this meeting going. Thank you so much.

TAIWO PETER AKINREMI:	Thank you, Bruna. Really appreciate. And hi, everyone. On behalf of the NomCom, would like to appreciate the opportunity you've given to

NomCom to do this outreach exercise. And I'll keep it short because there's no time.

Okay, so NomCom is actually recruiting for ICANN leadership positions. And we talk through this responsibility. And then we have a number of opening where we're looking for leaders to step forward to take responsibility for that. And I would like to announce that NomCom has extended the application period if you are considering that. It's an opportunity for you to [shoot your application right away.]

So what are we looking for? We're looking for people that have a professional skill set, such as critical thinking. We're looking for cultural awareness, to provide diversity [in outlook.] And we're looking for people with the knowledge of Internet governance, Internet architecture and protocol, domain name industry. And people that understand the ICANN environment. They could be outside the ICANN environment. We're looking for people that have board experience, executive experience, management experience.

If you're coming from the nonprofit sector also, you're welcome to shoot your application. I'm quite aware that I'm speaking with people that have experience with nonprofits background because I'm speaking with people that are at this table that are from the non-profit environment. So we're looking for people from technology, government, finance sector.

And why should we apply? I would like to speak to that. You have the opportunity to influence the global Internet policy. If you have been dreaming to influence ICANN decisions, this is the right time for you to

ICANN|73
VIRTUAL COMMUNITY FORUM

do so. We're looking for people that want to contribute to the evolution of the Internet, people that have professional skill set and that want to enhance that in ICANN environment. That is [inaudible] and diverse skill set, leaders from the industry. And certainly an opportunity for people that want to grow their own to have the professional skill set. And then they want to understand our [inaudible]. They want to understand how diverse stakeholder relate in a multistakeholder environment. So you're welcome to shoot your application if you want to do so.

We're looking for people that want to engage with the ICANN global community. One of the beautiful things of the ICANN environment is really the community. And we do things in bottom-up for sure. It's an opportunity for you to participate in that environment. Next slide, please.

So what we're looking for, we're looking for leaders. So if you're the one on the call and you're ready for a leadership position, then kindly shoot the application. So we're ready. We're looking to evaluate your application. And next slide please.

So for this year we're looking to recruit three members for the Board of Directors in the ICANN environment. So what we're typically looking for is first integrity. We're looking for people that have integrity. We're looking for people that have knowledge of the Internet environment and function. We're looking for people that understand the DNS environment [inaudible] and protocol.

We're looking for people with board experience that understand the functions of ICANN Board. We're looking for people that can commit to

the function of ICANN, people that can help us to shape ICANN and ICANN missions and vision because this [period that we are in] is very critical. So we're looking for people that understand the role and that understand responsibility. Please next slide.

So for the Public Technical Identifiers we're looking for one member to join the board. And don't be scared with the technical word. We're looking for people that can actually bring in diverse point of view on this board environment. So what are we typically looking for? We're looking for people that understand the operation of the registry, the registrar, the country code, gTLD. We're looking for people that understand Internet architecture.

And also we should inform here that we [inaudible] nonprofit experience. Because I'm speaking likely to the non-commercial stakeholder group [inaudible]. So if you have this experience, can you shoot your application? Next slide, please.

So this year we're looking for two members to join the ALAC committee. And we're looking at one for North America and one for Europe. So if you live in that environment you're encouraged to shoot your application. Apply, because we have moved the deadline for the application. So you can shoot your application. Next slide please.

So we're looking for one member to join the GNSO. So here what are we looking for? Because the GNSO is [inaudible] policy development processes. So we're looking for people that are understanding the multi-stakeholder policy making process and people that can make decision, that can [inaudible]. Next slide, please.

Okay, so these actually take a look at all the position that we're looking for. We're looking for three board members, one Public Technical Identifier to join the board of directors. We're looking for two members to join ALAC. That's one from Europe and one from North America. We're looking for one member to join GNSO Council. And we're looking for one member to join the Country Code Names Supporting Organization. So next slide, please.

So you can see this was supposed to close today but it has been extended. You have grace period to shoot your application. And in the next slide you will see the link for you to apply. So kindly go there to review all the criteria. But as I've said we're looking for people with nonprofit experience, board, management, and executive experience. So we're expecting to review your application. We're expecting to hear from you. So thank you for the opportunity once again. Over to you, Bruna.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you so much, Akinremi. Just to give everyone an opportunity in case any of our members or people attending this meeting want to ask a question or want to pose any questions to Akinremi or with regards to the NomCom process. If you do, please raise your hand. Or post them on the chat. If not, I think, feel free also to just drop Akinremi an email. And he can go through any questions or doubts you should have on this, right?

EN

So we have one question here. After how many years' sessions at ICANN it's appropriate to apply for a leadership position? I don't know if you want to take this, Akinremi.

TAIWO PETER AKINREMI: Yeah, thank you so much, Bruna. After how many years? Okay, so as I said, we're looking not particularly into the ICANN environment. But we're looking outside ICANN environment. If you have experience outside ICANN environment and that is experience related to what I just said or what is published on the NomCom website, so you feel free to apply. Okay, and if you have experience in the ICANN environment as well. Beautiful, that is a plus, okay? So we're happy to take your application. Just kindly go there and apply.

BRUNA SANTOS: Okay, thank you so much, Akinremi. I think we're going to move on to our next agenda item. But thank you once again for being here and for doing this outreach with our members.

So moving on, we're going to go into the constituency/NCSG updates. Just to get this conversation going, I would like to just let everyone know that on behalf of NCSG, [Andrea] and I are starting to work on the elections timeline. [Andrea] has a proposed draft. And I'm yet to review that. As you know, GNSO elections are coming up as well and we tend to align our elections with the GNSO as well. So once we have a draft of the election timeline I will write an email to the constituency leadership

ICANN|73
VIRTUAL COMMUNITY FORUM

teams to coordinate just so we can all have this process running at the same time or in similar timelines.

And in terms of the slots, if I'm not mistaken, at the NCSG level councilors with a term ending this year will be Wisdom, Stephanie, and Juan. And my term is also finishing as chair. So we will have three slots for new councilors and one slot for chair that will be open to elections. So if you're willing to run for any of these positions, feel free to start talking to people. You can talk to me or other councilors as well to see whether or not this is a relevant or an interesting position for you to be in. And I guess I put all of councilors and myself at your full disposition for us to discuss.

Other than that during this meeting we also had a short meeting with the board at the beginning of the week. This was one in which we had an interesting discussion on topics such as SSAD and the GPI. And I guess, just as a note, we need to follow-up with the board in scheduling the informal session we normally have with them post ICANN meetings. So it's a less formal opportunity for everyone to discuss other topics and ideas. So I'll probably send an email to the list soon about that.

And another action point I think we left that meeting with was possibly try to understand how we could help at the GPI, the Global Public Interest, debate from CCWP Human Rights or from the NCSG itself. So if anyone has comments or topics or ideas you would think it would be relevant for the NCSG engagement at the GPI, this is all very much welcome. So feel free to either raise your hand here or send the suggestions to the list as we will be discussing this in the following days.

I guess this is it from NCSG so far. I think Ben and Ken were going to present the updates on NCSG. So Benjamin and Ken, I don't know which of you is going to do the update. So feel free to raise your hand. And I'll hand you the floor. So Kenneth, please go ahead.

KENNETH HERMAN: Hi, good morning, good afternoon, evening, everybody. For those who are unfamiliar with me I'm the NCUC North America representative. And with Ben's help we agreed that I'll give you a brief update on what we're talking about these days. And he can jump in. Bruna, can you just confirm you can hear me?

BRUNA SANTOS: We can hear loud and clear, yeah.

KENNETH HERMAN: Okay, great, thanks. Okay, so three things I want to mention that we've been discussing in the NCUC. First is our ongoing outreach activities. All of us executive committee members have been pretty diligent about going through our respective mailing lists and trying to find out where all the people are. So we're looking for more people to become involved and to try and understand what the constituency members want to get out of their participation.

It's been an arduous task. I myself have found it incredibly frustrating because people simply don't get back. And my observation is that the pandemic has made it more difficult to reach people since I would have

picked up the phone normally and called people. But it's harder to do that when they're not in their offices. So that's the first thing. We're all working to enhance the participation and understanding of the constituency members and what they'd like to see.

Second thing I want to just point out is we've had some discussions about part of that outreach effort to enhance the website. Which was lacking in content and to try and develop some process to make it more reliable and reasonable and up to date. Along with that would be our social media activities. Try and enhance that a bit. And one thing that I've promised to do—and I'm working on—is to look at the process for the website. So of that there are three things that I've agreed to look at. I hope to have something soon.

First is to gain some control over who has access to the website. It seems that there isn't a formal process for handing over the keys to the website and the updates. So there I think a process for, as leadership transitions happen, a more effective method can be developed to transfer the security of the website over. Right now pretty much I think a lot of people who've been in and out have access to it.

Second point is content. And of that there's really, so it's the second and third is content creation and content approval. We want to encourage people to be writing content, all constituent members, to be writing content for the website. But it needs an approval process.

And the third point would be encouraging that and also developing that approval process through the executive committee members. So that's been an activity that we've been doing. So that's the website.

Third point is the missing Asia-Pacific representative on the executive committee. We are still looking for an AP representative to join the executive committee. That's been an ongoing task to try and identify and encourage somebody to come forward.

So those are the three things. We've got outreach activities. We've got website and social media activities. And we have a search for the AP representative. So that's my summary. Bruna and Benjamin, you are welcome to correct any mistakes, add any additional information. Or leave it at that. Thanks so much.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you, Ken. You did an amazing job. I think you covered all of our group current issues. I just also want to reach out to the community members that we're currently looking for social media volunteers to help us get really active online. This is our space. Let's not keep our voices quiet. So if you're good at that please show up for us. Let's engage with more of our community. Thank you.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you so much, Ben and Kenneth. I think it's a good point you're both raising both about the EC-AP member. If you can post a position once again on the list that would be really good. And also if you want to send the call for social media volunteers on the broader NCSG list, that's also very much welcome. So feel free to do so if you'd like to.

I guess we can move on to NPOC. I don't know how if Raoul can speak right now. I think you can, Raoul. If you do, the floor is yours. If not, just type it on the chat and then I can—

RAOUL PLOMMER: That's okay, Bruna.

BRUNA SANTOS: Okay, yeah. Thank you.

RAOUL PLOMMER: Yeah, thanks. Well, so I'm the chair of NPOC, the Nonprofit Organizations Constituency. And I don't have too many news since we last met. We haven't received back our proposal for the NPOC charter. But thinking of elections that are coming up next month, I think. Our next election will probably be the last one with six EC positions until the new charter kicks in. Where we've actually reduced EC seats. So the next election of NPOC would be a great opportunity to still get like this team of six to lead the Not-for-Profit Organizations Constituency.

We're also still in the process of showing our policy chair the ropes around doing the kind of scouting that one needs to do for staying up to date on the ongoing and new policy issues. So really if anybody can give us a hand about that, we'd really appreciate it. I'm sure our policy chair would do so, too.

And, yeah, that's pretty much all I have to say. It's been the quietest period between ICANN meetings after the two years we've been not

EN

seeing each other live. And I really hope the Hague meeting is going to happen. Because it's hard to believe but there might still be some room for even less activity on the non-commercial side of things. I'm hopeful that NPOC is doing worse than our sister constituencies in the non-commercial world.

But I think the NCUC and NCSG in general has really faced with, I don't know, maybe half of the activity that normally have when the live meetings are ongoing and so on. I don't think NPOC is alone with this. I'm definitely seeing less and less members joining the other meetings too. But, yeah, I think that's my share. And hoping to get more active people and the elections are a great time to do that. Thank you.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you, Raoul. Yeah, these are difficult times for everyone. And I guess there's a lot of us who are just tired or somehow exhausted or burnt out from this pandemic situation. But I wouldn't say that we have stopped working or that it's been the quietest moment of all, because if I do say so, our councilors might be really mad at me. Because I know there has been a lot of work on their side. And there has been a lot of activities in GNSO level and also at the policy committee one.

So taking this opportunity I'll also hand the floor to Tomslin because I know he has some policy committee announcements to us. So, Tomslin, you have the floor.

ICANN|73
VIRTUAL COMMUNITY FORUM

TOMSLIN SAMME-NLAR: Thank you, Bruna. And I promise not to repeat things that we discussed in the policy call earlier this week. So I just have two updates to give. One, the first is that the call for volunteers on the public comment on the policy status report on uniform domain name dispute resolution policy is still a need for volunteers.

If anyone, especially newcomers, who would like to get their hands—I want to say get their hands dirty but I shouldn't say that, but get into policy work, please volunteer. And you can start getting used to the discussions. It's a good way to start the journey with policy work if you're interested.

The second one is another call for volunteers to join the NCSG SubPro committee, which it's an email I sent earlier today, depending on where you live. For me it's yesterday. So this is something which was one of the action items from our policy call earlier this week. Where we agreed that we will stand up a SubPro committee to help councilors address some SubPro ODP questions and activity that are beginning to come back to Council. And the SubPro ODP just began and it's getting a bit busy. And I think councilors will do with some help with getting to NCSG positions. And having that discussion with a committee would be really great.

So as I mentioned in the email, please let me, Bruna, or [Andrea] know so that we can have you join. And, yeah, so those are the only two updates I had, Bruna. Thanks.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you so much, Tomslin. And, yes, as Tomslin said, if anyone wants to get started with the policy work. These opportunities are really good ones for you to start get acquainted with the discussions, the way NCSG likes some things, and how we have been putting our position across.

And let it be known that you're not going to be alone in this. Because you can write the draft comments or the draft position. And this will be submitted to the policy committee. And then everyone will get a chance to read through and comment. And then you're going to be working along together with a group of other volunteers, so things like that.

Just one short moment, Farzani really reminded me of this. About the Ukrainian situation, I think these are very difficult times for some of us. For like people from one of our leadership teams, Olga, who is living here right now. I have tried to talk to her a few times. And four days ago and she answered me telling me that she was okay.

But, yeah, this is a very complicated and dark moment in history. So, yeah, if you guys would like to try to talk to her as well. I've been trying my best just to make sure she's okay and her family, too. But if we have other members also from the region, it would be good to try to know whether they're okay or not. And also to acknowledge that this level of human rights violation that's happening in Ukraine right now with the invasion is just unacceptable.

So it's important for us to acknowledge that here, even despite the fact that this is not entirely the topic of ICANN meetings. But it's important for us to acknowledge those things. And apologies for moving on to something maybe less important.

EN

But we have to keep up with our agenda. And the next topic is DNS abuse. Also as another update note to you all, what's happened was that once again the Contracted Parties House reached out to us offering a meeting on the topic trusted notifiers. And that invitation prompted an internal chat with our members. And at the opportunity some of us posed concerns around the topic of abuse, how this discussion was being conducted throughout the community. Actually, also the lack of leadership from the org on this because some of us would have expected for the org to try to step in and help us coordinate the different initiatives across the industry.

But if I could just do a summary of the positions we had was that first of all, there was a concern around the chance of these discussions being used to expand the DNS abuse mission to content discussions and that ICANN and its stakeholders should also be concerned about our mission limited and not having the org as a content regulator.

And the second point that was the most noticeable one from the meeting as well was that some of us felt as if there were sort of a lack of understanding of what is the actual role for the CPH in trying to conduct the discussion on trusted notifiers.

Right now to some of us the problem that needs to be solved through the ICANN ecosystem is not yet clear, so these are the main concerns. And on that note we agreed on replying to this invitation for a meeting with the CPH to which I did and I'm waiting for a reply. And added to that our decisions were also to ask for a meeting with the GAC on this topic and also Göran Marby, as well as follow up with the idea of writing

a position paper about the DNS abuse. So this is just something that would help the rest of the community understand what does NCSG stand for in this discussion.

And for the meeting with the CPH I guess the consensus on what we will try to point out will be that, first of all, the trusted notifier issue is not really a new one. And we would like to understand the measurement and facts for a new initiative. Secondly, we would raise our concerns about the use of the DNS abuse term for content abuse and would try to bring some level of compromise on this topic. As well as try to push for a human rights impact assessment and insist on this topic having a proper one on that note.

So this is just an update from me. I now will open the floor to anyone who wants to weigh in on this discussion. Please raise your hand, or add some additional points to this. And just as a reminder, yesterday we also had a plenary session on DNS abuse. Unfortunately it was one that in which the Noncommercial Stakeholder was not truly represented. But that was also some sort of a mistake from my side. So we will try to push for having a better and improved conversation with other parts of the community on this topic because we know it's a really relevant one.

So if anyone wants to add anything to this, please raise your hand and I'll be happy to hand you the floor.

Yeah, Farzaneh, I don't know if you're still on the call but there is a request for you to update us on this call.

FARZANEH BADIEI:	Yeah, I'm sorry. I was busy fighting on Twitter. So you want me to update on the DNS abuse thing?
BRUNA SANTOS:	Yes, Kathy asked you if you could bring us an update on the plenary call from yesterday.
FARZANEH BADIEI:	Well, to be honest there are a number of issues that NCSG in general needs to pay attention to when it comes to DNS abuse. One is that we need to be present and engaged with the discussions. And the problem is that if you noticed, we were missing from the panel. And it's okay if we are—And this is not an oversight. We have been very active for a long time on these issues. And to be honest, when they don't have a Noncommercial perspective on the panel, especially when there is a webinar as opposed to an engaging session, then we need to agree to come up with a strategy to be included and be vocal about these issues. So that's one thing organization wise. Even if we are not on these panels, we need to start writing about them. We need to start engaging.

One of the problems that I see with the DNS abuse discussion is that some part of the community has given up on relying on facts to talk about DNS abuse. And despite the fact that they are not really problems that are not being solved or we are not really drowning in DNS abuse, the internet is not dying. Despite this fact, again, I see that the GNSO is going towards consulting with others and going towards convening DNS abuse PDP.

And this is I'm taking my crystal ball out and talking about this. Nothing is set in stone. But the council has sent these questions to the community to respond about DNS abuse. So we need to pay close attention to the development that is happening in the council as well.

The other problem that I see with the discussion is that yesterday we discussed—First of all, this was the topic and it was framed and discussed by the DNS Abuse Institute. The DNS Abuse Institute is an initiative that is done by PIR and registry. And they have an advisory council but essentially it's a registry initiative. So it is not multistakeholder and I don't know if it has started considering a diversity of views.

But so the conversation was framed by the DNSI, which is a good initiative. But it was a very granular conversation about like malicious domain names and compromised domain names. The issue of registration versus the issue of abuse of the protocol was not really discussed. The issues that we could have raised because when we don't raise the issue of registration versus protocol, then we don't know which actors we are actually talking about and who we should go through to actually tackle these DNS abuse instances. So sometimes we are asking registrars to do things that they can't do anything about.

And of course, I think that we need to have a general framework that considers our civil liberties and freedom of expression and what the Noncommercial interest is in this space by setting the framework and paying attention to the details of the discussion.

And so all I'm saying is that we need to be more active. Actually set the agenda and bring this discussion at the [inaudible]. If we don't do that, if we don't bring the civil liberties issues that comes with tackling DNS abuse, then we are going to see securitization of the DNS. We are going to see intellectual property overreach. And it's going to be a—And I have told this many times, all this DNS abuse, we are drowning and the internet is going to go bad. This all came about after WHOIS registrant private sensitive information was redacted due to GDPR. So they didn't have access to people's phone number and email addresses. So now they decided that, oh, yeah, we are really drowning in abuse because of that. So there's like this big push with not much logic or understanding of different perspectives.

Sorry, I talked a lot. And so I think that, just to wrap up, what we need to do is to look at the council. See what the council is doing. Be active in setting the agenda in the future conversation. Talk to the board more about this, especially like you can talk about DNS abuse and human rights. We can talk about—And we discussed this last time in a DNS abuse session, Bruna, with you and others, that maybe we can come up with a lightweight human rights impact of how the DNS abuse is tackled. And then go around and talk to people about what implications their efforts have on human rights.

And the other thing that we discussed yesterday, which I think we need to bring up, is that we need to tell the contracted party house to stop. Like, you know, at ICANN, like go around and create these discussions and stuff like that. They are not really working based on data. They're working based on pressure from others that they want them. And they

have like a gazillion initiatives on DNS abuse mushrooming around. So it's getting a little bit out of hand.

So at ICANN, at least, we need to be clear with them that, look, here are the human rights implications of DNS abuse. Here is the limited mission of ICANN. And here is what we can discuss. And we need to stop going around and just talking about this issue at ICANN. If they want to go around talking about this issue in other places, that's fine.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you, Farzaneh. Yes, I guess that, like I don't know how many of us watched the plenary yesterday. And the plenary was a good wake up call for everyone to understand how not well defined the limits of this discussion is. We had some people on the panel coming up and advocating for content related provisions or content related initiatives. So this is really something in which ICANN's mandated ending the remit is kind of at risk. And if we don't really step up into something like this it will be—It's a good and relevant discussion that would have gone on without the Noncommercial position and everything else.

So yeah, Kathy, I know you have your hand up. So I'll hand you the floor.

KATHY KLEIMAN: Sure, thank you. Can you hear me, Bruna? Okay. First, I want to share that Farzaneh did an amazing job at the plenary session yesterday. So this plenary session, for anybody who doesn't know, who's new to the meeting, is a cross community session where we talk about hot topic issues. And we should have been on the panel. I'm not sure, I haven't

been following DNS abuse lately. But Farzaneh was in the chat, and she was defending our interest. She was poking holes in arguments that needed holes poked into. She was raising critical issues.

And she's absolutely right, we should be on the panel next time. And she's absolutely right with the direction that we really need a lightweight NCSG. It should come up quickly and it won't be hard with a lightweight human rights impact of some of the concerns about the DNS abuse. Especially when it's scoped as broadly as some people tried to define it yesterday.

So what I wanted to do is quickly share a little bit of history of DNS abuse. And the excellent point that Farzaneh raised in chat. And, Farzaneh, I'm sorry, I wasn't able to kind of come into everything in the plenary yesterday. But I was watching kind of with horror at what was happening.

And so DNS abuse means different things to different people. It can be abuse of your domain name. And traditionally, that's meant kind of misuse of domain names in a way that harms the internet as a whole and is not content related. That could be using the domain name, the websites, other things and emails to communicate botnets, malware, and spam.

And we spent a long time at ICANN defining what DNS abuse means within our scope. And ICANN now tracks those statistics. But really, it's a problem to the whole internet. And let me note that often sometimes, and in fact often a domain name registrant may not know that on the back page of their website, somebody has planted a botnet or they

planted malware. So this can be completely oblivious to the domain name registrant.

But a number of people consider domain name abuse to be abuse of anything they don't like on your website. Any way that you use the domain name that they don't like. Which is content. Domain name abuse is—how did I write it down—is for anyone who criticizes them, critiques them, competes with them, some people consider that domain name abuse. Of course, that's far outside the remit of ICANN, far outside what we should doing.

But I heard the call for it yesterday, as did Farzaneh, the call that anything someone doesn't like, let's suspend the domain name or take it down pending. That could kill noncommercial organizations, of course, small and large. That could kill individual speech, free speech. And that could kill small businesses and entrepreneurs. It's just a bad way to proceed. I actually think that the registries and registrars are concerned. I heard a lot of concern from them yesterday about what they're being asked to do with DNS abuse.

So I think we may be in the position of helping them rather than hurting them, and helping ICANN stay within its scope, stay within its bylaws. If we can jump in on the DNS abuse I think our voice will be a really, really important one. Thank you Bruna. Thanks Farzaneh, thanks everyone.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you, Kathy. And I fully agree with you. If we could finally jump into this discussion and actually reply to their invitations for having a

conversation with us this will be of good use and of good help to everything because some parts of the community who have joined this discussion have joined in a rather critical way. They're not actually dedicating any time to go into the discussions and actually bringing some new criticism to the debate. And I think this is something we were always good at. We would always be able to bring new perspectives from our activism background, from our grassroots background that this will be very helpful.

And maybe we can do as a follow up as well is it's not just to try to go after the CPH. And I will send another email for Keith this week asking for this meeting that they invited us to. But also reach out to newer initiatives such as the domain name abuse institute. I know that there is a lot of curiosity around their community, maybe we can reach out to Graeme and try to understand what is the DNS Institute for? How can we help? How can we better breach this issue with them and whether or not there would be any path for collaboration between the two groups on this topic.

So if everyone agrees, we can maybe follow up with this suggestion as well. And as we try to construct the NCSG position on this topic, which both Kathy and Farzaneh reminded us that we need to do a revision, a sharp review of what we're saying and how we are saying this. I don't know if anyone else wants to jump in or would have any additional topics or comments on this. Lydia? Let's see, I'm just taking some time to—Yes, Kathy, please go ahead.

KATHY KLEIMAN: I was wondering if anyone in the room, any NCSG member has experience with DNS abuse, has been working on it maybe at the national or local level and that we could talk to. Do we have expertise in the room? Okay, just thought I'd ask.

BRUNA SANTOS: That's a good question. I think lots of us have some experience on different areas, but not specifically on the abuse one. But nevertheless, we can still add some relevant topics on the human rights perspective, on grassroots ones, and many other topics that we have been working on for the past years.

And just so everyone knows, there's also a mailing list dedicated to this. So if you want to join, please let me, Tomslin, or Andrea know that you would like to join the DNS abuse mailing list. Just so we're trying to connect some dots and to have the discussion there until we have something more better well shaped. And then we can share with the broader list. Ben, please go ahead.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Hello, this is Benjamin speaking. [inaudible] said maybe I want to share about the GPI. So I participated in this GPI conversation, which is global public interest. And that conversation was interesting, but also [Avri] introduced a new framework to identify what should be considered as global public interest. And that is a very interesting conversation that I think we should get involved in as well. So I just want you guys to also look at it and see if the framework aligns or work well with us. Because

as it was explained the board or ICANN org identifies some individuals who would deliberate over some issues and are going to use this framework to decide in the general conversations in the multistakeholder agreement what issues should be identified as global public interest issues.

So the argument basically is to different persons, different things can be of global public interest. And yes, we know in true fairness that you know what is of public interest. But now that there's a tool, how is the tool going to be used? So I just think it is important for us to be involved and just look at our tool, either to support it or to ask for some adjustment, or to see if it's not anything that's going to hurt us in the future. That's just what I want to say.

I am very indifferent at this moment. I mean, also some of the things identified in the tool that is modifiable as issues arise. So what are the things that are going to decide how modifiable it is? When would it be changed? And all of that, so we just need to look at it as well. Yeah, thank you.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you so much, Ben. And although the conversation was about DNS abuse, we can definitely talk about GPI as well. And from what I gathered in the room these days on the policy committee meeting, there is some interest for us to do some work on this. We can definitely talk to Ephraim and the guys at the CCWP Human Rights to see— because some of us believe that there is a good avenue there for the work to start. At least discussing a human rights impact assessment and

also some proper group reviews of the GPI the way it's proposed nowadays.

So I feel like definitely there is some interest on this. But then again, I don't believe this is something Ephraim could do himself, alone. So if anyone else wants to join and wants to help on this, that would be really good. And also another good opportunity for learning some things about NCSG and ICANN's positions and everything else.

So yeah, we're going to continue this conversation with Ephraim, and also the mailing list on the GPI as well. And I'm also proposing that we take this issue to our informal meeting with the board that I'm still to schedule. And yeah, and maybe this is another thing we can bring up to the GAC once we have a meeting with them as well in the future. So yeah, I would put this—But I fully agree with the relevance on this topic.

I think we can move on to AOB. I don't know if anyone has any additional topics you would like to bring to this group. If you do, please raise your hand. But while you decide I'm just taking this time to reply to an earlier question about how can new people become members of NCSG.

There is a dedicated page for membership questions and membership points. So you can just go to this one. There is a proper form for membership application. And you just have to be sure that your organization is working within the Noncommercial realm, you're not affiliated into any sort of industry parts, and also working in alignment with our core values and mission. So the membership application is there.

ICANN|73
VIRTUAL COMMUNITY FORUM

We're pretty much open to anyone as long as you don't have any affiliation with the private sector or other parts of government. So please take a look, see if it fits your organization, your own work on the domain name system and many other topics that ICANN is working on. So yeah, that's it.

I don't know if anyone else has last minute AOBs. But if not, I will just say that I will follow up with the meeting request with CPH, DNS Abuse Institute, and also the GAC, and the board for us to continue these conversations. And I would also like to thank you all for this time and participating in this meeting. Hopefully, the [inaudible] will be some sort of a hybrid meeting, we don't know yet. But let's hope, let's cross our fingers that we get to see each other again, and in the near future.

So thank you all for being here. And if anyone doesn't have anything to say, I think we can adjourn this meeting, Andrea. Thank you so much.

ANDREA GLANDON: Rafik's hand is up.

BRUNA SANTOS: Okay. It's not showing up for me. Rafik, please go ahead. So sorry.

RAFIK DAMMAK: Okay, thanks. Thanks, Bruna. Sorry, I didn't want to keep the meeting longer. But just wanted maybe to ask for follow up. So I was not sure because also I didn't attend the policy meeting. I think the GNSO council has several small teams, if it's possible to share some updates

about the progress there and at which stage they are. And if there is any position we need to work on. So that will be helpful to discuss more in the mailing list. So I think maybe I saw on the GNSO council list some draft, but I would like if it's possible from our counselor to send more updates about the different small teams to the list. That's it. Thanks.

BRUNA SANTOS: Thank you, Rafik. Tomslin [inaudible] to you.

TOMSLIN SAMME-NLAR: Yes, just to let Rafik know that did come up during the policy meeting. And we agreed that we'll speak to the members in the small teams to send some written updates as well on the mailing list. So that's an action item from the meeting. Thanks.

BRUNA SANTOS: And also, Tomslin, this is also an action item for the two of us, right? Because we promised we would improve communications with the list. So hopefully right after this meeting you'll get just a short email from Tomslin and myself just bringing up some short updates. A two paragraph email with calls and updates from both the PC, and council and general stakeholder group initiatives.

TOMSLIN SAMME-NLAR: Yes, I think I already began with that, Bruna. So yeah, I agree.

EN

BRUNA SANTOS: Yes, perfect. So hopefully we are going to do on this topic as well, the small teams, right? I don't know if there's any other hands up. Just Tomslin for now. So, Tomslin, legacy hand, new hand? Old hand, okay. So, again, thank you all for joining this meeting. Hopefully we'll get to see each other again. And I think we can close for now. And, yeah, have a nice end of ICANN73 everyone.

ANDREA GLANDON: Thank you. You can stop the recording now.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

ICANN|73
VIRTUAL COMMUNITY FORUM